SENATE, No. 934 STATE OF NEW JERSEY 220th LEGISLATURE

INTRODUCED JANUARY 31, 2022

Sponsored by: Senator SHIRLEY K. TURNER District 15 (Hunterdon and Mercer) Senator NIA H. GILL District 34 (Essex and Passaic)

Co-Sponsored by: Senator Burgess

SYNOPSIS

Establishes guidelines for creditworthiness determinations concerning affordable housing programs.

CURRENT VERSION OF TEXT

As introduced.



(Sponsorship Updated As Of: 3/30/2023)

1 AN ACT establishing creditworthiness analysis guidelines for 2 affordable housing and supplementing P.L.1945, c.169 (C.10:5-1 3 et seq.). 4

5

BE IT ENACTED by the Senate and General Assembly of the State of New Jersey:

6 7 8

1. The Legislature finds and declares that:

9 The current shortage of affordable housing in this State has a. 10 forced many low and moderate income New Jersey residents to live 11 in market rate housing they cannot afford but must occupy rather 12 than face homelessness.

b. After paying rent, these struggling families and individuals 13 14 are frequently left with less money than needed to meet other basic 15 household obligations. Late or partial payments, as well as missed 16 payments made up in subsequent months, are often the result.

17 c. These undesirable but unavoidable decisions negatively 18 affect many households' credit reports and inevitably lead to lowercredit scores for these New Jersey residents. 19

20 d. Access to housing with affordable rents would remedy a 21 major cause of the financial difficulties experienced by lower-22 income persons, leave them with more income to meet their basic 23 expenses, and help them to restore their credit standing.

24 e. Those households fortunate enough to obtain tenant-based 25 housing subsidies, or access to cost-controlled housing units, 26 generally after years spent on waiting lists, are often rejected by 27 landlords based upon inadequate credit assessments.

These credit assessments overlook the totality of the 28 f. 29 circumstances that confronted the particular family or individual in 30 question, fail to recognize that the credit issues are generated by the 31 very problem that affordable housing would resolve, disregard the 32 limited choices available to affected households, and discount their 33 best efforts to deal with those challenges.

34 Available reports, studies and data demonstrate that, because g. 35 of past and present discriminatory practices, and the persistence of structural and intentional racism, unregulated and unlimited use of 36 37 tenant screening criteria, including those such as credit scores and 38 reports, and other forms of credit analysis, have disparately 39 impacted African-Americans, other people of color, the disabled, 40 and other protected classes, and have also been used as a pretext to 41 accomplish otherwise prohibited discrimination against members of 42 those classes.

h. It is in the interest of the public to ensure that low- and 43 44 moderate-income persons are not unfairly denied the opportunity to 45 obtain housing they can afford and desperately need.

46 i. It is also in the public interest to establish, in relation to housing subsidy and affordable housing programs, fair and just 47 48 standards and guidelines for credit evaluation and the use of credit

scores, credit reports, and related assessments of creditworthiness or
 fitness to be a tenant.

3

4 2. For the purposes of P.L. , c. (C.) (pending before 5 the Legislature as this bill):

6 "Ability to pay rent" means:

a. for federal, State or local voucher holders, or applicants for
project-based deep subsidy units, that the gross monthly household
income of the affordable housing applicant is equal to or exceeds 2.5
times the share or portion of the total monthly rent that the tenant shall
be required to pay; multipliers based upon the total rent for the
dwelling unit, including both the tenant's share of the rent and the
subsidized portion of the rent, shall not be permitted; and

14 b. for all other dwelling units limited to occupancy by low or moderate income households, that the gross monthly household 15 16 income of the affordable housing applicant is equal to or exceeds 2 17 times the amount of the monthly rent the household will be required to 18 pay; provided, however, that the required amount of income needed if 19 the applicant is certified as income eligible for a particular dwelling 20 unit pursuant to the applicable provisions of the Uniform Housing 21 Affordability Controls promulgated by the New Jersey Housing and 22 Mortgage Finance Agency shall be in accordance with those 23 provisions, or, in the case of an applicant with a disability, shall be the 24 amount required in order to provide a reasonable accommodation 25 pursuant to the "Law Against Discrimination," P.L.1945, c.169 26 (C.10:5-1 et seq.), the federal "Fair Housing Amendments Act of 27 1988," (42 U.S.C. s.3601 et seq.) or other applicable statute or 28 regulation.

29 "Affordable housing applicant" means a low or moderate income 30 household that possesses a State or federal tenant-based housing 31 subsidy; or a household that applies to lease any rental dwelling unit 32 that is restricted to occupancy by low or moderate income households 33 pursuant to any State or federal affordable housing or subsidy 34 program, including but not limited to the "Fair Housing Act," 35 P.L.1985, c.222 (C.52:27D-301 et al.), and any low or moderate 36 income housing mandated pursuant to a court order or settlement.

37 "Credit or other risk score or assessment" means a number or other 38 form of rating that is derived from an algorithm, computer application, 39 model, or other process that is based in whole or in part on credit 40 information, court records or similar data, and which purports to 41 characterize or categorize a person's creditworthiness, fitness to be a 42 tenant, or other position or status. The term includes but is not limited 43 to FICO or other credit scores, tenant scores, insurance scores or other 44 enumerations. The term also includes the use of generic events or 45 occurrences, such as a filing or discharge in bankruptcy, or being a 46 named party in a court proceeding, as justification for denying a 47 person credit or admission to an apartment or other rental dwelling.

"Creditworthiness" means the determination of a landlord or creditor, in accordance with section 4 or 5 of P.L., c. (C.) (pending before the Legislature as this bill), with regard to a prospective tenant's fitness to be a tenant or resident of a particular housing complex or dwelling unit.

6 "Deep rental subsidy" means a State or federal tenant-based 7 housing subsidy, or State or federal project-based housing subsidy, 8 which limits the tenant's share of the rental payment to a percentage of 9 the tenant's income, and which can be adjusted to maintain that 10 percentage should the tenant's income change.

"Low or moderate income household" means a household meeting
the applicable State or federal definition of such households for the
particular housing program or housing units in question.

14 "State or federal tenant-based housing subsidy" means a tenant-15 based subsidy, enabled pursuant to a State or federal tenant-based 16 housing program available to low or moderate income households, 17 including but not limited to section 3 of P.L.2004, c.140 (C.52:27D-18 287.3), commonly known as the State rental assistance program, or the 19 federal Housing Choice Voucher (Section 8) Program.

20

3. On or after the effective date of P.L., c. (C. 21) (pending 22 before the Legislature as this bill), a credit or other risk score or 23 assessment calculated or disseminated by any entity shall not be used in any manner to evaluate the creditworthiness of an affordable 24 25 housing applicant. A creditworthiness evaluation of an affordable 26 housing applicant shall involve an individualized assessment 27 conducted in accordance with the applicable provisions of sections 4 28 or 5 of P.L. . c. (C.) (pending before the Legislature as this 29 bill).

30

4. a. A rental housing application submitted by an affordable
housing applicant with a tenant-based deep rental subsidy, or for a
dwelling unit with a project-based deep rental subsidy, shall not be
denied based on an assertion of lack of creditworthiness if the
applicant has the ability to pay rent.

36 b. Notwithstanding the provisions of subsection a. of this 37 section, an applicant so described may be rejected for lack of 38 creditworthiness if, within the previous three years, and while in 39 receipt of a tenant-based deep rental subsidy, or while residing in a 40 dwelling unit with a project-based deep rental subsidy, the applicant 41 failed on two or more occasions to pay the unsubsidized tenant 42 share of the monthly rent in accordance with the rental agreement; 43 provided, however, that, prior to making the decision to deny such 44 an applicant, the landlord shall conduct an individualized 45 assessment of the specific facts and circumstances surrounding the 46 failures to pay. The individualized assessment shall include, but 47 shall not be limited to, factors such as any disputes regarding the 48 amounts of rent due, the accuracy of the calculations determining

the tenant's share of the rent, and other relevant factors as they may be present. If the applicant had a bona fide reason for the failures to pay and subsequently paid all outstanding amounts owed as the tenant's share, then the applicant shall not be denied based on a lack of creditworthiness.

6 c. Rent discharged in a bankruptcy proceeding shall not be7 considered unpaid for the purposes of this section.

8 9

5. a. For all situations not covered by section 4 of P.L., c.

10) (pending before the Legislature as this bill), and unless (C. standards more favorable to the applicant are mandated by other 11 12 federal or State laws or regulations, a landlord proposing to 13 evaluate the creditworthiness of an affordable housing applicant 14 who has demonstrated an ability to pay rent, shall conduct an 15 individualized assessment of the applicant's income, employment, 16 and payment history. The individualized assessment shall include, 17 at a minimum, an evaluation of the following factors: employment 18 history and wage history, especially the amount of household 19 income in relation to the cost of living in the region; rent or 20 mortgage and utility payment history; health history, including any 21 health issues affecting other members of the applicant household; 22 the need for a reasonable accommodation in the case of a household 23 which includes a person with a disability; and the extent to which 24 the household developed a budget or payment plan that enabled it to 25 meet most of its expenses most of the time, keeping payments of 26 expenses as close to current as was reasonably possible, and 27 considering the occurrence of unanticipated problems, and 28 emergencies or other factors that significantly affected the 29 household's ability to adhere to any such budget.

30 b. Notwithstanding any provision of subsection a. of this 31 section to the contrary, for the purposes of evaluating the 32 creditworthiness of an affordable housing applicant, there shall be a 33 rebuttable presumption that an applicant household is creditworthy 34 if: (1) the applicant household has demonstrated an ability to pay 35 rent; (2) a member or members of the household has a history of 36 regular employment or has been in receipt of another source of 37 regular income; and (3) despite a household income that has been, 38 for a period of time, below the self-sufficiency level as that term is 39 defined under section 3 of P.L.1992, c.43 (C.34:15D-3) or was 40 otherwise inadequate to meet its basic needs, the household made a 41 good faith effort to meet its regular rent or mortgage obligations 42 and other household expenses, and was able to do so most of the 43 time.

c. Notwithstanding any provision of subsection a. of this section
to the contrary, an affordable housing applicant who has completed
a credit counseling or debt management course certified by the
Department of Community Affairs shall be presumed creditworthy,
provided that the applicant household has demonstrated an ability to

S934 TURNER, GILL

6

pay the rent. A presumption of creditworthiness based upon the
 provisions of this subsection shall only be available on one occasion
 to any affordable housing applicant.

4

5 6. If a landlord denies a rental housing application from an 6 affordable housing applicant, approves an application with 7 conditions that exceed reasonable conditions routinely imposed 8 upon a prospective tenant, or takes any other adverse action on an 9 affordable housing applicant's rental housing application, the 10 landlord shall provide a written notice of the adverse action to the 11 applicant that states the reasons for the adverse action. The adverse 12 action notice shall disclose any screening information about the 13 affordable housing applicant accessed by the landlord, and shall 14 append any screening report about the applicant that was accessed by 15 the landlord. The adverse action notice shall be provided in a 16 substantially similar format as set forth in this section, unless an 17 alternative format is established pursuant to rules and regulations of 18 the Attorney General. The adverse action notice shall include specific 19 written findings as to each of the factors that landlords are required to 20 consider as part of the individualized assessment. An adverse action 21 notice that does not include a specific finding as to each factor or that 22 does not consider the facts and circumstances relevant to the particular 23 affordable housing applicant shall be deemed presumptively invalid 24 and shall not constitute a lawful basis upon which to take adverse 25 All written notices required herein, action against an applicant. 26 including but not limited to the adverse action notice, shall be printed 27 in both the English and Spanish languages and given to the affordable 28 housing applicants. In any county in which the Language Access Plan 29 of the Department of Community of Affairs indicates that five percent 30 or more of the residents' primary language is any language other than 31 English or Spanish, all written notices in that county shall also be 32 printed in that additional language. 33 34 ADVERSE ACTION NOTICE 35 36 Name 37 Address

38 City/State/Zip Code

39 40

41

42 Rejected

43 Approved, subject to the following conditions:

44 45

46 Adverse action on your application was based, in part, on the47 following:

This notice is to inform you that your application has been:

S934 TURNER, GILL

7

1Information contained in a consumer report (The prospective 2 landlord shall include the name, address, and phone number of the 3 consumer reporting agency that furnished the consumer report that 4 contributed to the adverse action.) 5 Information received from previous rental history or reference 6 Information received in a criminal record 7 Information received in a court filing or other court record 8 Information received from an employment verification 9 Other 10 The following is (are) the name(s), address(es), and phone number(s) of each of the consumer reporting agencies, or other 11 12 agencies or entities, that furnished the reports or information 13 referred to above: 14 15 16 Your application was not accepted, or was approved with the additional conditions described above, for the following reasons 17 (include specific facts and circumstances relevant to the particular 18 applicant in relation to each of the enumerated factors that the 19 20 owner/landlord is required to consider as part of an individualized 21 assessment, as well as any other stated screening criteria): 22 23 24 Dated this day of, (year) 25 Agent/Owner Signature" 26 27 7. Each landlord that denies, or takes any adverse action against, any affordable housing applicant for creditworthiness reasons shall be 28 29 required to submit to the Attorney General, on an annual basis, a report 30 that contains the following information for the preceding 12-month 31 reporting period: 32 a. the number of applications for affordable housing reviewed 33 over the preceding 12-month reporting period; 34 b. the number of denials of applications for housing rendered on 35 the basis of creditworthiness reasons; the number of denials to which the affordable housing 36 c. 37 applicant filed a complaint in Superior Court; d. the number of denials that were overturned or found unlawful 38 39 in Superior Court; and 40 e. the information required under subsections a. through d. 41 disaggregated by the race of the applicant, the ethnicity of the 42 applicant, the sex of the applicant, and whether the applicant had a 43 disability. 44 45 8. a. In addition to the types of discrimination set forth in 46 subsections g., h., i., j., l., and m. of section 11 of P.L.1945, c.169 (C.10:5-12), it shall constitute unlawful discrimination for a 47 48 landlord to use a credit or other risk score or assessment, calculated

1 or disseminated by any entity in any manner, to evaluate the 2 creditworthiness of an affordable housing applicant in a way that 3 violates the provisions of P.L., c. (C.) (pending before the Legislature as this bill). 4 5 b. A person claiming to be aggrieved pursuant to P.L., c.) (pending before the Legislature as this bill) may file a 6 (C. 7 complaint or action with the Division on Civil Rights in the 8 Department of Law and Public Safety, or in the Superior Court of 9 New Jersey, alleging a violation of the "Law Against 10 Discrimination," P.L.1945, c.169 (C.10:5-1 et seq.). 11 c. Following the receipt of a complaint the Director of the 12 Division on Civil Rights in the Department of Law and Public 13 Safety shall be authorized to prohibit the landlord from renting out 14 the housing unit that the claimant applied for, pending the investigation of the claim. 15 16 17 9. The Attorney General, in accordance with the "Administrative Procedure Act," P.L.1968, c.410 (C.52:14B-1 et seq.), and in 18 19 consultation with the Commissioner of Community Affairs, shall 20 adopt rules and regulations to effectuate P.L., c. (C.) (pending 21 before the Legislature as this bill) on or before the effective date of 22 P.L., c. (C.) (pending before the Legislature as this bill). The 23 rules and regulations adopted by the Attorney General may restrict the 24 application of the provisions of P.L., c. (C.) (pending before 25 the Legislature as this bill), if necessary to comply with federal law. 26 27 10. This act shall take effect on the first day of the third month 28 next following enactment. 29 30 31 **STATEMENT** 32 33 This bill would supplement the "Law Against Discrimination," 34 P.L.1945, c.169 (C.10:5-1 et seq.), to establish guidelines for 35 determining the creditworthiness of applicants seeking to rent 36 affordable housing units. The critical shortage of affordable 37 housing in New Jersey has forced many low- and moderate-income 38 households to reside in market-rate housing they cannot afford but 39 must occupy to avoid homelessness. These struggling families and 40 individuals are frequently left with less money than needed to meet 41 other basic household obligations. Late or partial payments, as well as missed payments made up in subsequent months, are often the 42 43 These undesirable but unavoidable decisions negatively result. 44 affect the households' credit reports and inevitably lead to lower-45 credit scores. As a result, many in the State are coping with 46 damaged credit. 47 Except in the specific circumstances provided in the bill, the bill 48 would prohibit landlords from considering credit scores and other

1 risk scores or assessments when determining the creditworthiness of 2 a rental housing applicant who is the holder of a State or federal 3 tenant-based housing subsidy. The bill provides that the 4 consideration of negative credit history for such rental housing 5 applicants would only be permitted if the tenant has, within the 6 previous three years and while in receipt of a rental subsidy, failed 7 on two or more occasions to pay the unsubsidized tenant share of 8 the monthly rent in accordance with a rental agreement. Prior to 9 making the decision to deny such an applicant, the bill would 10 require the landlord to conduct an individualized assessment of the 11 specific facts and circumstances surrounding the failures to pay. 12 After a review of the circumstances, the holder of the State or federal tenant-based housing subsidy would still be deemed 13 14 creditworthy if the tenant has a bona fide reason for late rental 15 payments.

16 Regarding other applicants for affordable rental housing who do 17 not hold State or federal tenant-based housing subsidies, the bill 18 would only permit the landlord to assess the applicant's 19 creditworthiness if the landlord also conducts an individualized 20 assessment of the applicant's income, employment, payment, and 21 credit history. The individualized assessment would include, at a minimum, an evaluation of the following factors: employment 22 23 history and wage history, especially the amount of household 24 income in relation to the cost of living in the region; rent or 25 mortgage and utility payment history; health history, including any 26 health issues affecting other members of the applicant household; 27 the need for a reasonable accommodation in the case of a household 28 which includes a person with a disability; and the extent to which 29 the household attempted and was able to develop a budget or 30 payment plan that enabled it to meet most of its expenses most of 31 the time, keeping payments of expenses as close to current as was reasonably 32 possible, and considering the occurrence of 33 unanticipated problems, and emergencies or other factors that 34 significantly affected the household's ability to adhere to any such 35 budget.

36 Additionally, the bill would require that, for the purposes of 37 evaluating the creditworthiness of an affordable housing applicant, 38 there would be a rebuttable presumption that the applicant 39 household is creditworthy if (1) the applicant household has 40 demonstrated an ability to pay rent, as defined in the bill, (2) a 41 member of the household has a history of regular employment or 42 has been in receipt of another source of regular income, and (3) 43 despite a household income that in the past was, for a period of 44 time, below the self-sufficiency level or was otherwise inadequate 45 to meet its basic needs, the household made a good faith effort to 46 meet its regular rent or mortgage obligations and other household 47 expenses, and was able to do so most of the time. An affordable 48 housing applicant who has completed a credit counseling or debt

management course certified by the Department of Community
 Affairs would also be presumed creditworthy, provided that the
 applicant household has demonstrated an ability to pay rent.

4 The bill further directs that, if a landlord denies a rental housing 5 application from an affordable housing applicant, approves an application with conditions that exceed reasonable conditions 6 7 routinely imposed upon a prospective tenant, or takes any other 8 adverse action, then the landlord would be required to provide a 9 written notice of the adverse action to the applicant. The adverse 10 action notice would disclose any screening information about the applicant accessed by the landlord, and append any screening report 11 12 that the landlord accessed. The adverse action notice would include the findings as to each of the factors that are required for consideration 13 14 in the individualized assessment. An adverse action notice that does 15 not include a specific finding as to each factor or that does not 16 consider the facts and circumstances relevant to the particular 17 applicant would be deemed presumptively invalid and would not be 18 considered to constitute a lawful basis upon which to take adverse 19 action against an applicant. The bill requires the notices to be printed 20 in both the English and Spanish languages and given to the applicants. 21 In any county in which the Language Access Plan of the Department 22 of Community of Affairs indicates that five percent or more of the 23 residents' primary language is any language other than English or 24 Spanish, all written notices in that county would also be printed in that 25 additional language.

The bill requires each landlord that denies, or takes any adverse action against, any applicant for creditworthiness reasons to submit to the Attorney General, on an annual basis, a report that contains the following information for the preceding 12-month reporting period:

30 (1) the number of applications for housing reviewed over the31 preceding 12-month reporting period;

32 (2) the number of denials of applications for housing rendered on33 the basis of creditworthiness reasons;

34 (3) the number of denials to which the applicant filed a complaint35 in Superior Court;

36 (4) the number of denials that were overturned or found unlawful37 in Superior Court; and

38 (5) a disaggregation of the information provided based on the race
39 of the applicant, the ethnicity of the applicant, the sex of the applicant,
40 and whether the applicant had a disability.

The bill allows a person claiming to be aggrieved pursuant to the provisions of the bill to file a complaint or action with the Division on Civil Rights in the Department of Law and Public Safety, or in the Superior Court of New Jersey, alleging a violation of the "Law Against Discrimination," P.L.1945, c.169 (C.10:5-1 et seq.). Following the receipt of a complaint the Director of the Division on Civil Rights would be authorized by the bill to prohibit the landlord

S934 TURNER, GILL 11

- 1 from renting out the housing unit that the claimant applied for,
- 2 pending the investigation of the claim.
- 3 The bill directs the Attorney General, and in consultation with the
- 4 Commissioner of Community Affairs, to adopt rules and regulations to
- 5 effectuate the bill on or before the first day of the third month next
- 6 following enactment of the bill, which would coincide with the
- 7 effective date of the bill.