ASSEMBLY, No. 5468 STATE OF NEW JERSEY 220th LEGISLATURE

INTRODUCED MAY 18, 2023

Sponsored by: Assemblyman LOUIS D. GREENWALD District 6 (Burlington and Camden) Assemblyman P. CHRISTOPHER TULLY District 38 (Bergen and Passaic)

SYNOPSIS

Permits Government Records Council staff attorneys to adjudicate certain government records complaints.

CURRENT VERSION OF TEXT

As introduced.



2

1 AN ACT concerning the duties of the staff attorneys of the 2 Government Records Council to adjudicate certain government 3 records complaints, and amending P.L.2001, c.404. 4 5 **BE IT ENACTED** by the Senate and General Assembly of the State 6 of New Jersey: 7 8 1. Section 8 of P.L.2001, c.404 (C.47:1A-7) is amended to read 9 as follows: 10 8. a. There is established in the Department of Community 11 Affairs a Government Records Council. The council shall consist 12 of the Commissioner of Community Affairs or the commissioner's designee, the Commissioner of Education or the commissioner's 13 14 designee, and three public members appointed by the Governor, 15 with the advice and consent of the Senate, not more than two of 16 whom shall be of the same political party. The three public 17 members shall serve during the term of the Governor making the 18 appointment and until the appointment of a successor. A public member shall not hold any other State or local elected or appointed 19 20 office or employment while serving as a member of the council. A 21 public member shall not receive a salary for service on the council 22 but shall be reimbursed for reasonable and necessary expenses 23 associated with serving on the council and may receive such per 24 diem payment as may be provided in the annual appropriations act. 25 A member may be removed by the Governor for cause. Vacancies 26 among the public members shall be filled in the same manner in 27 which the original appointment was made. The members of the 28 council shall choose one of the public members to serve as the 29 council's chair. The council may employ an executive director and 30 such professional and clerical staff as it deems necessary and may 31 call upon the Department of Community Affairs for such assistance 32 as it deems necessary and may be available to it. 33 b. The Government Records Council shall: 34 establish an informal mediation program to facilitate the 35 resolution of disputes regarding access to government records; 36 receive, hear, review and adjudicate a complaint filed by any 37 person concerning a denial of access to a government record by a 38 records custodian; 39 issue advisory opinions, on its own initiative, as to whether a 40 particular type of record is a government record which is accessible 41 to the public; 42 prepare guidelines and an informational pamphlet for use by 43 records custodians in complying with the law governing access to 44 public records;

Matter underlined <u>thus</u> is new matter.

EXPLANATION – Matter enclosed in **bold-faced** brackets **[**thus**]** in the above bill is not enacted and is intended to be omitted in the law.

prepare an informational pamphlet explaining the public's right
 of access to government records and the methods for resolving
 disputes regarding access, which records custodians shall make
 available to persons requesting access to a government record;

5 prepare lists for use by records custodians of the types of records 6 in the possession of public agencies which are government records;

make training opportunities available for records custodians and
other public officers and employees which explain the law
governing access to public records; and

operate an informational website and a toll-free helpline staffed
by knowledgeable employees of the council during regular business
hours which shall enable any person, including records custodians,
to call for information regarding the law governing access to public
records and allow any person to request mediation or to file a
complaint with the council when access has been denied;

In implementing the provisions of subsections d. and e. of this section, the council shall: act, to the maximum extent possible, at the convenience of the parties; utilize teleconferencing, faxing of documents, e-mail and similar forms of modern communication; and when in-person meetings are necessary, send representatives to meet with the parties at a location convenient to the parties.

In implementing the provisions of this section, the staff attorneys
 of the council, as authorized by the council, shall receive, hear,
 review, and adjudicate complaints filed by a person concerning a
 denial of access to a government record by a records custodian. A
 decision of a staff attorney may be appealed to the council in
 accordance with procedures established by the council.

In the event that a complaint involves a novel or complex matter,
 the council shall convene to adjudicate the complaint after staff
 attorneys conduct a review, investigation, and hearing, and prepare
 a report on the complaint.

c. At the request of the <u>staff attorneys of the</u> council, a public
 agency shall produce documents and ensure the attendance of
 witnesses with respect to the [council's] investigation by the
 <u>council's staff attorneys</u> of any complaint or the holding of any
 hearing.

37 d. Upon receipt of a written complaint signed by any person 38 alleging that a custodian of a government record has improperly 39 denied that person access to a government record, the council shall 40 offer the parties the opportunity to resolve the dispute through 41 mediation. Mediation shall enable a person who has been denied 42 access to a government record and the custodian who denied or 43 failed to provide access thereto to attempt to mediate the dispute 44 through a process whereby a neutral mediator, who shall be trained 45 in mediation selected by the council, acts to encourage and facilitate 46 the resolution of the dispute. Mediation shall be an informal, 47 nonadversarial process having the objective of helping the parties 48 reach a mutually acceptable, voluntary agreement. The mediator shall assist the parties in identifying issues, foster joint problem
 solving, and explore settlement alternatives.

e. If any party declines mediation or if mediation fails to 3 4 resolve the matter to the satisfaction of all parties, the staff 5 attorneys of the council shall initiate an investigation concerning the facts and circumstances set forth in the complaint. The staff 6 7 attorneys of the council shall make a determination as to whether 8 the complaint is within its jurisdiction or frivolous or without any 9 reasonable factual basis. If the staff attorneys of the council shall 10 conclude that the complaint is outside its jurisdiction, frivolous or 11 without factual basis, [it] they shall reduce that conclusion to 12 writing and transmit a copy thereof to the complainant and to the 13 records custodian against whom the complaint was filed. 14 Otherwise, the staff attorneys of the council shall notify the records 15 custodian against whom the complaint was filed of the nature of the 16 complaint and the facts and circumstances set forth therein. The 17 custodian shall have the opportunity to present the [board] staff 18 attorneys with any statement or information concerning the 19 complaint which the custodian wishes. If the staff attorneys of the 20 <u>council</u> [is] <u>are</u> able to make a determination as to a record's 21 accessibility based upon the complaint and the custodian's response 22 thereto, [it] they shall reduce that conclusion to writing and 23 transmit a copy thereof to the complainant and to the records 24 custodian against whom the complaint was filed. If the staff 25 attorneys of the council [is] are unable to make a determination as 26 to a record's accessibility based upon the complaint and the 27 custodian's response thereto, [the council] they shall conduct a 28 hearing on the matter in conformity with the rules and regulations 29 provided for hearings by a State agency in contested cases under the 30 "Administrative Procedure Act," P.L.1968, c.410 (C.52:14B-1 et seq.), insofar as they may be applicable and practicable. [The] 31 32 Upon an appeal from a decision of the staff attorneys, the council 33 shall, by a majority vote of its members, render a decision as to 34 whether the record which is the subject of the complaint is a 35 government record which must be made available for public access 36 pursuant to P.L.1963, c.73 (C.47:1A-1 et seq.) as amended and 37 supplemented. If the staff attorneys of the council determine, or the 38 council determines, by a majority vote of its members, that a 39 custodian has knowingly and willfully violated P.L.1963, c.73 40 (C.47:1A-1 et seq.), as amended and supplemented, and is found to 41 have unreasonably denied access under the totality of the 42 circumstances, the council may impose the penalties provided for in 43 section 12 of P.L.2001, c.404 (C.47:1A-11). A decision of the 44 council may be appealed to the Appellate Division of the Superior 45 Court. A decision of the council shall not have value as a precedent 46 for any case initiated in Superior Court pursuant to section 7 of 47 P.L.2001, c.404 (C.47:1A-6). All proceedings of the staff attorneys and of the council pursuant to this subsection shall be conducted as
 expeditiously as possible.

f. The council shall not charge any party a fee in regard to
actions filed with the council. The council shall be subject to the
provisions of the "Open Public Meetings Act," P.L.1975, c.231
(C.10:4-6), except that the council may go into closed session
during that portion of any proceeding during which the contents of a
contested record would be disclosed. A requestor who prevails in
any proceeding shall be entitled to a reasonable attorney's fee.

g. The council shall not have jurisdiction over the Judicial or
Legislative Branches of State Government or any agency, officer, or
employee of those branches.

13 (cf: P.L.2001, c.404, s.8)

14

15 2. Section 6 of P.L.2001, c.404, (C.47:1A-5) is amended to read 16 as follows:

17 6. a. The custodian of a government record shall permit the 18 record to be inspected, examined, and copied by any person during 19 regular business hours; or in the case of a municipality having a 20 population of 5,000 or fewer according to the most recent federal 21 decennial census, a board of education having a total district 22 enrollment of 500 or fewer, or a public authority having less than 23 \$10 million in assets, during not less than six regular business hours 24 over not less than three business days per week or the entity's 25 regularly-scheduled business hours, whichever is less; unless a 26 government record is exempt from public access by: P.L.1963, c.73 27 (C.47:1A-1 et seq.) as amended and supplemented; any other 28 statute; resolution of either or both houses of the Legislature; 29 regulation promulgated under the authority of any statute or 30 Executive Order of the Governor; Executive Order of the Governor; 31 Rules of Court; any federal law; federal regulation; or federal order. 32 Prior to allowing access to any government record, the custodian 33 thereof shall redact from that record any information which 34 discloses the social security number, credit card number, unlisted 35 telephone number, or driver license number of any person, or, in accordance with section 2 of P.L.2021, c.371 (C.47:1B-2), the home 36 37 address, whether a primary or secondary residence, of any active, 38 formerly active, or retired judicial officer, prosecutor, or law 39 enforcement officer, or, as defined in section 1 of P.L.2021, c.371 40 (C.47:1B-1), any immediate family member thereof; except for use 41 by any government agency, including any court or law enforcement 42 agency, in carrying out its functions, or any private person or entity 43 acting on behalf thereof, or any private person or entity seeking to 44 enforce payment of court-ordered child support; except with respect 45 to the disclosure of driver information by the New Jersey Motor 46 Vehicle Commission as permitted by section 2 of P.L.1997, c.188 47 (C.39:2-3.4); and except that a social security number contained in 48 a record required by law to be made, maintained or kept on file by a

6

1 public agency shall be disclosed when access to the document or 2 disclosure of that information is not otherwise prohibited by State 3 or federal law, regulation or order or by State statute, resolution of 4 either or both houses of the Legislature, Executive Order of the 5 Governor, rule of court or regulation promulgated under the 6 authority of any statute or executive order of the Governor. Except 7 where an agency can demonstrate an emergent need, a regulation 8 that limits access to government records shall not be retroactive in 9 effect or applied to deny a request for access to a government 10 record that is pending before the agency, the staff attorneys of the 11 council, the council or a court at the time of the adoption of the 12 regulation.

13 b. (1) A copy or copies of a government record may be 14 purchased by any person upon payment of the fee prescribed by law 15 or regulation. Except as otherwise provided by law or regulation 16 and except as provided in paragraph (2) of this subsection, the fee 17 assessed for the duplication of a government record embodied in the 18 form of printed matter shall be \$0.05 per letter size page or smaller, 19 and \$0.07 per legal size page or larger. If a public agency can 20 demonstrate that its actual costs for duplication of a government 21 record exceed the foregoing rates, the public agency shall be 22 permitted to charge the actual cost of duplicating the record. The 23 actual cost of duplicating the record, upon which all copy fees are 24 based, shall be the cost of materials and supplies used to make a 25 copy of the record, but shall not include the cost of labor or other 26 overhead expenses associated with making the copy except as 27 provided for in subsection c. of this section. Access to electronic 28 records and non-printed materials shall be provided free of charge, 29 but the public agency may charge for the actual costs of any needed 30 supplies such as computer discs.

31 (2) No fee shall be charged to a victim of a crime for a copy or
32 copies of a record to which the crime victim is entitled to access, as
33 provided in section 1 of P.L.1995, c.23 (C.47:1A-1.1).

34 c. Whenever the nature, format, manner of collation, or volume 35 of a government record embodied in the form of printed matter to 36 be inspected, examined, or copied pursuant to this section is such 37 that the record cannot be reproduced by ordinary document copying 38 equipment in ordinary business size or involves an extraordinary 39 expenditure of time and effort to accommodate the request, the 40 public agency may charge, in addition to the actual cost of 41 duplicating the record, a special service charge that shall be 42 reasonable and shall be based upon the actual direct cost of 43 providing the copy or copies; provided, however, that in the case of 44 a municipality, rates for the duplication of particular records when 45 the actual cost of copying exceeds the foregoing rates shall be 46 established in advance by ordinance. The requestor shall have the 47 opportunity to review and object to the charge prior to it being 48 incurred.

1

1 d. A custodian shall permit access to a government record and 2 provide a copy thereof in the medium requested if the public agency 3 maintains the record in that medium. If the public agency does not 4 maintain the record in the medium requested, the custodian shall 5 either convert the record to the medium requested or provide a copy in some other meaningful medium. If a request is for a record: (1) 6 7 in a medium not routinely used by the agency; (2) not routinely 8 developed or maintained by an agency; or (3) requiring a substantial 9 amount of manipulation or programming of information technology, 10 the agency may charge, in addition to the actual cost of duplication, 11 a special charge that shall be reasonable and shall be based on the 12 cost for any extensive use of information technology, or for the 13 labor cost of personnel providing the service, that is actually 14 incurred by the agency or attributable to the agency for the 15 programming, clerical, and supervisory assistance required, or both. 16 Immediate access ordinarily shall be granted to budgets, e. 17 bills, vouchers, contracts, including collective negotiations 18 agreements and individual employment contracts, and public 19 employee salary and overtime information.

20 f. The custodian of a public agency shall adopt a form for the 21 use of any person who requests access to a government record held 22 or controlled by the public agency. The form shall provide space 23 for the name, address, and phone number of the requestor and a 24 brief description of the government record sought. The form shall 25 include space for the custodian to indicate which record will be 26 made available, when the record will be available, and the fees to be 27 charged. The form shall also include the following: (1) specific 28 directions and procedures for requesting a record; (2) a statement as 29 to whether prepayment of fees or a deposit is required; (3) the time 30 period within which the public agency is required by P.L.1963, c.73 31 (C.47:1A-1 et seq.) as amended and supplemented, to make the 32 record available; (4) a statement of the requestor's right to challenge 33 a decision by the public agency to deny access and the procedure 34 for filing an appeal; (5) space for the custodian to list reasons if a 35 request is denied in whole or in part; (6) space for the requestor to 36 sign and date the form; (7) space for the custodian to sign and date 37 the form if the request is fulfilled or denied. The custodian may 38 require a deposit against costs for reproducing documents sought 39 through an anonymous request whenever the custodian anticipates 40 that the information thus requested will cost in excess of \$5 to 41 reproduce.

g. A request for access to a government record shall be in writing and hand-delivered, mailed, transmitted electronically, or otherwise conveyed to the appropriate custodian. A custodian shall promptly comply with a request to inspect, examine, copy, or provide a copy of a government record. If the custodian is unable to comply with a request for access, the custodian shall indicate the specific basis therefor on the request form and promptly return it to

A5468 GREENWALD, TULLY

8

1 the requestor. The custodian shall sign and date the form and 2 provide the requestor with a copy thereof. If the custodian of a 3 government record asserts that part of a particular record is exempt 4 from public access pursuant to P.L.1963, c.73 (C.47:1A-1 et seq.) 5 as amended and supplemented, the custodian shall delete or excise 6 from a copy of the record that portion which the custodian asserts is 7 exempt from access and shall promptly permit access to the 8 remainder of the record. If the government record requested is 9 temporarily unavailable because it is in use or in storage, the 10 custodian shall so advise the requestor and shall make arrangements 11 to promptly make available a copy of the record. If a request for 12 access to a government record would substantially disrupt agency 13 operations, the custodian may deny access to the record after 14 attempting to reach a reasonable solution with the requestor that 15 accommodates the interests of the requestor and the agency.

h. Any officer or employee of a public agency who receives a
request for access to a government record shall forward the request
to the custodian of the record or direct the requestor to the
custodian of the record.

20 i. (1) Unless a shorter time period is otherwise provided by 21 statute, regulation, or executive order, a custodian of a government 22 record shall grant access to a government record or deny a request 23 for access to a government record as soon as possible, but not later 24 than seven business days after receiving the request, provided that 25 the record is currently available and not in storage or archived. In 26 the event a custodian fails to respond within seven business days 27 after receiving a request, the failure to respond shall be deemed a 28 denial of the request, unless the requestor has elected not to provide 29 a name, address or telephone number, or other means of contacting 30 the requestor. If the requestor has elected not to provide a name, 31 address, or telephone number, or other means of contacting the requestor, the custodian shall not be required to respond until the 32 33 requestor reappears before the custodian seeking a response to the 34 original request. If the government record is in storage or archived, 35 the requestor shall be so advised within seven business days after 36 the custodian receives the request. The requestor shall be advised 37 by the custodian when the record can be made available. If the 38 record is not made available by that time, access shall be deemed 39 denied.

40 (2) During a period declared pursuant to the laws of this State as 41 a state of emergency, public health emergency, or state of local 42 disaster emergency, the deadlines by which to respond to a request 43 for, or grant or deny access to, a government record under 44 paragraph (1) of this subsection or subsection e. of this section shall 45 not apply, provided, however, that the custodian of a government 46 record shall make a reasonable effort, as the circumstances permit, 47 to respond to a request for access to a government record within 48 seven business days or as soon as possible thereafter.

A5468 GREENWALD, TULLY

1 A custodian shall post prominently in public view in the part j. 2 or parts of the office or offices of the custodian that are open to or 3 frequented by the public a statement that sets forth in clear, concise 4 and specific terms the right to appeal a denial of, or failure to 5 provide, access to a government record by any person for inspection, examination, or copying or for purchase of copies 6 7 thereof and the procedure by which an appeal may be filed. 8 k. The files maintained by the Office of the Public Defender that 9 relate to the handling of any case shall be considered confidential 10 and shall not be open to inspection by any person unless authorized by law, court order, or the State Public Defender. 11 12 (cf: P.L.2021, c.371, s.11) 13 14 3. This act shall take effect immediately. 15 16 17 **STATEMENT** 18 19 The Government Records Council (GRC) has many duties with 20 regard to the law commonly referred to as the open public records 21 act. Among its duties, the GRC adjudicates complaints submitted 22 to the council concerning a denial of access to a government record 23 by a records custodian. 24 The council consists of the Commissioner of the Department of 25 Community Affairs, the Commissioner of the Department of 26 Education, and three public members appointed by the Governor. 27 The council employs an executive director, professional staff, such as a staff attorney, and clerical staff as it deems necessary. 28 29 Under this bill, the staff attorneys of the council will receive, 30 hear, review, and adjudicate complaints. The decision of a staff 31 attorney may be appealed to the council. 32 Under current law, a decision of the council may be appealed to 33 the Appellate Division of the Superior Court. 34 Under current practice, the council meets monthly for the 35 adjudication of complaints and other matters. This bill will permit staff attorneys to adjudicate complaints on a regular basis, which 36 37 should help alleviate the council's backlog of complaints. 38 This bill is in response to the recommendations of the Office of 39 the State Comptroller (OSC) July 2022 report regarding the GRC 40 and its review and adjudication of public records complaints. The 41 OSC expressed concern that the GRC has not processed public 42 records complaints in a timely manner and recommended that the 43 GRC utilize the staff attorneys of the council to receive, hear, 44 review, and adjudicate complaints. The council will retain its

45 current process to hear appeals of decisions of staff attorneys.