# SENATE, No. 1412 STATE OF NEW JERSEY 211th LEGISLATURE

INTRODUCED MARCH 29, 2004

Sponsored by: Senator SHIRLEY K. TURNER District 15 (Mercer)

SYNOPSIS

"The Development Subsidy Job Goals Accountability Act."

**CURRENT VERSION OF TEXT** As introduced.



2

1 AN ACT concerning accountability for certain employment goals and 2 requirements in connection with development subsidies and 3 supplementing Title 52 of the Revised Statutes. 4 5 **BE IT ENACTED** by the Senate and General Assembly of the State 6 of New Jersey: 7 8 1. This act shall be known and may be cited as "The Development 9 Subsidy Job Goals Accountability Act." 10 11 2. The Legislature finds and declares that: 12 a. Although the State and its local government units have granted 13 numerous tax incentives, grants and other economic development 14 subsidies during the last 25 years, the inflation-adjusted wage level for a large portion of New Jersey workers has declined, as has the 15 16 percentage of working families in New Jersey with health care 17 coverage; 18 b. When workers receive low wages and poor benefits, such jobs 19 often impose hidden taxpayer costs upon New Jersey's citizens, in the 20 form of uncompensated health care, Medicaid, food stamps, child-care subsidies, earned income tax credits and other forms of public 21 22 assistance to the working poor and their families; 23 c. Citizen participation in economic development has been impeded 24 by a lack of readily accessible information regarding expenditures and 25 outcomes; 26 d. It is therefore appropriate, in order to improve the effectiveness 27 of expenditures for economic development and to ensure that they 28 achieve the goal of raising living standards for working families, that 29 the State collect, analyze and make public information regarding those 30 expenditures and to enact effective safeguards for their use. 31 32 3. For the purposes of this act: 33 "Corporate parent" means either: a person, association, corporation, joint venture, partnership, or other business entity, that 34 owns or controls 50% or more of a recipient corporation; or the 35 36 recipient corporation itself, if no other person, association, 37 corporation, joint venture, partnership, or other entity, owns or controls 50% or more of the recipient corporation. 38 39 "Date of development subsidy" means the initial date that a granting 40 body provides the monetary value of a development subsidy to a 41 recipient corporation provided, however, that if the development 42 subsidy is for the installation of new equipment, the date shall be the 43 date the recipient corporation puts the equipment into service and 44 provided, further, that if the development subsidy is for improvements 45 to property, the date shall be the date the improvements are finished or the date the recipient corporation occupies the property, whichever 46

1 is earlier.

2 "Development subsidy" means the providing to a recipient 3 corporation of an amount of funds from a public body with a value of 4 not less than \$25,000 for the purpose of stimulating economic 5 development in New Jersey, including, but not limited to, any bond, 6 grant, loan, loan guarantee, tax increment financing, fee waiver, land 7 price subsidy, matching fund or any tax expenditure. "Development 8 subsidy" does not refer to any contract under which a public body 9 purchases or otherwise procures goods, services or construction on an 10 unsubsidized basis, including any contract solely for the construction 11 or renovation of a facility owned by a public body. "Development 12 subsidy" does not mean any providing of funds from a public body to 13 a recipient corporation, including by means of a tax expenditure, for 14 the exclusive purpose of subsidizing site remediation, recycling, 15 commuter transportation assistance or other programs to improve the environment, or for the exclusive purpose of providing benefits to 16 employees of the recipient corporation. 17

"Economically distressed municipality" means a New Jersey
municipality that had an unemployment rate more than 150% of the
Statewide unemployment rate during not less than two of the last three
calendar years, or is an Abbott district as defined in section 3 of
P.L.1996, c.138 (C.18A:7F-3).

23 "Employee benefits" means the average rate of benefit costs paid by a recipient corporation to or for its employees, including, but not 24 25 limited to, the cost to the recipient corporation of health care benefits, 26 pension benefits and apprenticeship or other training and education 27 benefits, but excluding any costs to the recipient corporation of 28 unemployment compensation, workers' compensation or temporary 29 disability benefits, Social Security benefits, or any other employee 30 benefits which the recipient corporation is required by State or federal 31 law to pay. "Employee benefits" do not include any payroll deductions 32 or other costs paid by employees for the benefits.

33 "Full-time job" means a job in which an individual is employed by34 a recipient corporation for at least 35 hours per week.

35 "Granting body" means a public body that provides a development
36 subsidy and, in the case of a tax expenditure related to any tax paid to
37 the State, means the State Treasurer.

38 "Part-time job" means a job in which an individual is employed by39 a recipient corporation for less than 35 hours per week.

40 "Project site" means the site of a project inside New Jersey for41 which any development subsidy is provided.

42 "Public body" means the State or any political subdivision of the
43 State or any agency, instrumentality or authority of the political
44 subdivision.

45 "Recipient corporation" means any non-governmental person,46 association, corporation, joint venture, partnership or other entity that

1 receives a development subsidy.

2 "Small business" means a recipient corporation whose corporate

3 parent, and all subsidiaries thereof, employ fewer than 25 full-time

4 employees or have total gross receipts of less than \$1,000,000 during

5 the most recent calendar year.

6 "State" means the State of New Jersey and any agency,7 instrumentality or authority of the State, but not any political8 subdivision of the State.

9 "Tax expenditure" means the amount of uncollected tax revenues 10 from any abatement, reduction, exemption or credit against any State or local tax, including, but not limited to, taxes on real property, raw 11 12 materials, inventories or other assets, taxes on gross receipts, income 13 or sales, and any use, excise or utility tax. "Tax expenditure" does not 14 refer to any credit against any tax liability of an employee or any 15 personal exemption, homestead rebate, credit or deduction for the expenses of a household or individual, or other reduction of the tax 16 liability of an individual or household. 17

18 "Temporary job" means a job for which an individual is hired for a
19 limited period of time, which shall include all jobs for construction at
20 the project site.

"Value of a development subsidy" means the dollar value of the development subsidy provided to the recipient corporation. In the case of a loan or loan guarantee provided by a public body to a recipient corporation, the "value of a development subsidy" means the amount loaned.

26

4. Each applicant for a development subsidy shall submit to the
granting body an application for the development subsidy on a form
prepared by the State Treasurer. The information required on the
application shall include the following:

31 a. An application tracking number provided by the granting body;

b. The names, street and mailing addresses and phone numbers of
the chief officer of the granting body, the chief officer of the
applicant's corporate parent and the applicant and the street address
and three-digit North American Industry Classification System number
of the project site;

37 c. The start date and the end date, if any, of the development38 subsidy;

d. A list of all development subsidies that the applicant is
requesting or receiving, the name of any other granting body from
which development subsidies are sought or obtained, the value of each
development subsidy and the aggregate value of all development
subsidies requested or received from all sources;

e. A signed certification by the chief officer of the recipient
corporation that the application is accurate and meets the requirements
of this act, including all of the requirements of section 9 of this act

1 regarding the minimum number and minimum weekly pay and benefit

2 levels of the jobs created or retained as a result of the development

3 subsidies;

4 f. The total number of individuals employed by the applicant at the

project site on the date of the application, the anticipated number of
jobs that will be retained as a result of the development subsidy and
the number of new jobs to be created by the applicant at the project
site if the development subsidy is granted, broken down by full-time,
part-time and temporary jobs;

g. The following information regarding all current and anticipatedemployees at the project site:

12 (1) Gender and ethnicity;

13 (2) The average weekly wage rate;

14 (3) Status with regard to working in full-time, part-time, or15 temporary jobs;

(4) Which employee benefits are provided and the average weeklycost to the employer of each benefit; and

18 (5) Union representation.

h. The average total number of individuals employed in New Jersey
during the calendar year preceding the submission of the application
by the applicant's corporate parent and all subsidiaries thereof, broken
down by full-time, part-time and temporary jobs;

i. A statement as to whether the development subsidy may reduce
employment at any other site controlled by the applicant or its
corporate parent, inside or outside the State, resulting from
automation, merger, acquisition, corporate restructuring or other
business activity; and

j. A statement as to whether or not the project involves the
relocation of work from another address and if so, the number of jobs
to be relocated and the address from which they are to be relocated.

Any granting body other than the State Treasurer approving the application shall send a copy to the State Treasurer not more than 15 business days after approval. If the application is not approved, the granting body shall retain the application.

35

5. a. Each recipient corporation of a development subsidy shall file with the granting body, on a form prepared by the State Treasurer, a progress report no later than 15 business days after the end of each State fiscal year for the duration of the development subsidy or for five years, whichever period is longer. The report shall include the following information for the State fiscal year just ended:

42 (1) The application tracking number, except in the case of a
43 development subsidy which has no application tracking number
44 because the development subsidy was in effect prior to the 180th day
45 after the effective date of this act;

46 (2) The name, street and mailing addresses, phone number and

1 chief officers of the granting body and the recipient corporation;

(3) A summary of the number of jobs required to be retained or
created inside New Jersey pursuant to sections 8 and 9 of this act, and
the number actually created, retained or lost inside New Jersey, broken
down by full-time, part-time and temporary jobs, and the average

6 weekly rates of pay and benefits;

7 (4) The type and amount of health care coverage provided to the
8 employees at the project site, including any costs borne by the
9 employees;

(5) The comparison of the total employment in New Jersey by the
corporate parent of the recipient corporation on the date of the
application and the date of the report, broken down by full-time, parttime and temporary jobs;

(6) A statement as to whether the use of the development subsidy
during the previous fiscal year has reduced employment at any other
site controlled by the recipient corporation or its corporate parent,
inside or outside of New Jersey, as a result of automation, merger,
acquisition, corporate restructuring or other business activity; and

(7) A signed certification by the chief officer of the recipientcorporation that the progress report is accurate.

21 In each annual progress report filed after the two-year progress 22 report filed pursuant to subsection b. of this section, the recipient 23 corporation shall certify whether the recipient corporation is in 24 compliance with the job creation, wage and benefit requirements of 25 sections 8 and 9 of this act, and whether the corporate parent of the 26 recipient corporation is in compliance with the Statewide employment 27 requirement of those sections. If the requirements of those sections 28 are not being met, the report shall provide a full disclosure of the 29 amount of any shortfall in job creation and retention rates and wage 30 and benefit rates compared to the rates required by those sections.

b. Not later than 15 days after the second anniversary of the date
of the development subsidy, the recipient corporation shall file with
the granting body a two-year progress report, certified by the chief
officer of the recipient corporation, which shall include:

(1) The same information as required to be included in reports filedpursuant to subsection a. of this section;

(2) A statement of whether the recipient corporation has achieved
the job creation and retention and wage and benefit requirements of
sections 8 and 9 of this act and whether the corporate parent of the
recipient corporation has maintained 90% of its employment in New
Jersey; and

42 (3) If the goals are not met, a full disclosure of the amount of any
43 shortfall in job creation and retention rates inside New Jersey and
44 wage and benefit rates compared to the goals and compared to job
45 creation and retention requirements and wage and benefit rates
46 required pursuant to sections 8 and 9 of this act.

1 c. The granting body shall review each report filed by the recipient 2 corporation and conduct such further investigations as may be required 3 to verify or correct the information in the report and submit the 4 verified or corrected report to the State Treasurer not later than 30 business days after the report is filed by the recipient corporation. The 5 6 State Treasurer shall compile and publish all data from the progress 7 reports in both written and electronic form, including on the Internet. 8 d. The recipient corporation shall provide the granting body and 9 the State Treasurer access to the project site and records at reasonable 10 times as needed to monitor the project and verify the accuracy of the 11 information provided in reports made by the recipient corporation. If 12 a recipient corporation fails to file a report by the required due date, the granting body may impose an administrative fine of not more than 13 14 \$500 per day to commence upon the tenth working day after the due 15 date, and not more than \$1,000 per day to commence on the twentieth work day after the due date. If a recipient corporation fails to provide 16 17 the required access, the granting body may impose an administrative 18 fine of not more than \$500 per day to commence upon the fifth 19 working day that access is denied, and of not more than \$1,000 per 20 day to commence upon the tenth working day that access is denied.

21 A granting body may assess from recipient corporations e. 22 whatever fees it determines to be necessary, but in no case fees greater 23 than 0.5% of the value of a development subsidy if the development 24 subsidy is a loan or loan guarantee or greater than 1.0% of the value 25 if the development subsidy is not a loan or loan guarantee, to pay for 26 the costs of the granting body to carry out its responsibilities under 27 this act, including the processing of applications for development 28 subsidies, reviewing and verifying reports of recipient corporations and 29 monitoring the compliance of recipient corporations with the 30 requirements of this act, maintaining and making available records and, in the case of the State Treasurer, producing the annual Unified 31 32 Economic Development Budget Report and providing, as part of the 33 annual budget request of the Governor, a comprehensive presentation 34 of the costs of all development subsidies to the State.

35

6. a. The State Treasurer shall, not more than four months after
the end of each State fiscal year, compile and publish, in printed and
electronic form, including on the Internet, an annual Unified Economic
Development Budget Report with regard to the fiscal year just
concluded. The report shall provide the following comprehensive
information regarding the costs and benefits of all development
subsidies of the State and its political subdivisions:

(1) Information regarding tax expenditures resulting from any
development subsidy, including the name of each recipient corporation
receiving one or more tax expenditures with a combined total value
equal to or greater than \$100,000, the value of all tax expenditures

1 received by each recipient corporation and summaries of the number 2 of full-time and part-time jobs created or retained, employee benefits 3 provided and the degree to which job creation and retention, wage and 4 benefit goals and requirements of recipient corporations and parent corporations have been met. Any tax expenditure received by a 5 6 corporation receiving tax expenditures with a total value of less than 7 \$100,000 shall not be itemized. The report shall include aggregate 8 dollar amounts for each category of tax expenditure, each 9 geographical area, the number of companies for each category of tax 10 expenditure, the number of full-time and part-time jobs created or 11 retained, the employee benefits provided, and the degree to which job 12 creation and retention, wage and benefit goals and requirements have 13 been met for each category of tax expenditure; and

14 The costs of all expenditures of development subsidies (2)15 appropriated by any granting body, including, but not limited to, the Departments of Labor and Education, the New Jersey Economic 16 17 Development Authority, the New Jersey Commerce and Economic 18 Growth Commission, the New Jersey Commission on Higher 19 Education, the New Jersey Commission on Science and Technology, 20 research and business assistance programs of public institutions of 21 higher education, Workforce Investment Boards, local and regional 22 economic development agencies, county improvement authorities, 23 together with the cost to the granting bodies and the value of the 24 development subsidies received by each recipient corporation, and 25 summaries of the number of full-time and part-time jobs created or 26 retained, employee benefits provided, and the degree to which job 27 creation and retention, wage and benefit goals and requirements of 28 recipient corporations and parent corporations have been met.

b. The State Treasurer shall provide to the Legislature, as part of
the annual budget request of the Governor, a comprehensive
presentation of the costs of all development subsidies to the State
during the prior fiscal year, an estimate of the anticipated costs of
development subsidies for the then current fiscal year and an estimate
of the costs of all development subsidies for the fiscal year of the
requested budget, including, but not limited to:

36 (1) The total cost to the State of tax expenditures resulting from
37 the development subsidies, the costs for each category of tax
38 expenditure, and the amounts of tax expenditures by geographical
39 area; and

(2) The cost to the State of all appropriated expenditures for
development subsidies, including line-item budgets for every Statefunded entity concerned with economic development, including, but
not limited to, the Departments of Labor and Education, the New
Jersey Economic Development Authority, the New Jersey Commerce
and Economic Growth Commission, the New Jersey Commission on
Higher Education, the New Jersey Commission on Science and

9

Technology, research and business assistance programs of public

1

2 institutions of higher education, Workforce Investment Boards, local 3 and regional economic development agencies, county improvement 4 authorities. 5 6 7. All documents or records submitted to or maintained by the State Treasurer or any granting body pursuant to this act, including, 7 8 but not limited to, applications, progress reports, recapture notices and 9 any other related records or proceedings, shall be available for review by any member of the public, and copies of the records shall be 10 11 provided upon request at cost. 12 13 8. a. A public body shall not grant a development subsidy to a 14 recipient corporation in any case in which the total value per job of all 15 development subsidies provided from all sources to the recipient corporation is: 16 (1) Greater than \$50,000 per job created inside New Jersey or 17 \$15,000 per job inside New Jersey retained if all of the jobs are 18 19 located in an economically distressed municipality; or 20 (2) Greater than \$35,000 per job created inside New Jersey or 21 \$10,000 per job retained inside New Jersey if not all of the jobs are 22 located in an economically distressed municipality.

The value per job of the development subsidies shall be determined by dividing the total value of the subsidies by the anticipated number of full-time jobs inside New Jersey, excluding temporary jobs, disclosed in the application pursuant to subsection f. of section 4 of this act. The granting body may set maximum levels of development subsidy per job which are higher, but not lower, than the levels specified in this subsection.

b. (1) A granting body shall not grant a development subsidy to a
recipient corporation that is a small business unless the average weekly
wages plus the average weekly employer-paid benefit costs paid to all
employees at the project site, except employees in temporary jobs,
equals or exceeds the larger of:

(a) 75% of the average weekly, unemployment insurance-covered
wage paid in New Jersey for the industry in which the employees work
at the project, as established by the United States Bureau of Labor
Statistics; or

39 (b) 50% of the Statewide average weekly remuneration paid to
40 workers by employers, as determined under subsection (c) of R.S.
41 43:21-3.

42 (2) A granting body shall not grant a development subsidy to a
43 recipient corporation that is not a small business unless the average
44 weekly wages plus the average weekly employer-paid benefit costs
45 paid to all employees at the project site, except employees in
46 temporary jobs, equals or exceeds the larger of:

1 (a) 85% of the average weekly, unemployment insurance-covered 2 wage paid in New Jersey for the industry in which the employees work 3 at the project, as established by the United States Bureau of Labor 4 Statistics; or (b) 60% of the Statewide average weekly remuneration paid to 5 6 workers by employers, as determined under subsection (c) of R.S. 7 43:21-3. 8 A granting body may set minimum wage and benefit requirements 9 higher, but not lower, than the levels specified in this subsection. 10 c. The requirements of subsection b. of this section regarding wage 11 levels shall not apply to any development subsidy with the exclusive 12 purpose of providing subsidized employment or training for disabled 13 individuals, training or education of individuals less than 18 years old,

- 14 or literacy or basic skills training.
- 15

9. a. A recipient corporation shall, not later than two years after
the date of the development subsidy, fulfill the requirements of section
8 of this act regarding job creation and retention and wage and benefit
requirements for the project site. The recipient corporation shall
maintain its job creation and wage goals as long as the development
subsidy is in effect, or five years, whichever is longer.

b. The corporate parent of a recipient corporation shall, as long as
the development subsidy is in effect, or not less than five years,
whichever is longer, maintain at least 90% of the amount of
employment in New Jersey disclosed in the recipient corporation's
application for the development subsidy pursuant to subsection h. of
section 4 of this act.

c. If the requirements of subsection a. or b. of this section are not
fulfilled, the granting body shall recapture the development subsidy
from the recipient corporation as follows:

31 Upon a failure by the recipient corporation to create or (1)32 maintain the required number of jobs inside New Jersey or to pay the 33 required wages and benefits at the project site, the amount recaptured 34 shall be a percentage of the total amount of the development subsidy which equals the percentage that the underpayment of wages and 35 benefits represents of the total required wages and benefits. The total 36 37 required wages and benefits for a year shall be calculated by 38 multiplying the required amount of employment inside New Jersey 39 times the required combined rate of wages and benefits paid to the 40 employees. The underpayment of wages and benefits shall be calculated by multiplying any shortfall in the combined average wage 41 42 and benefit rate times any shortfall in the amount of employment.

43 (2) Upon a failure of the corporate parent to maintain 90% of its
44 employment in New Jersey, the rate of recapture shall equal twice the
45 percentage by which that employment is less than 90%.

46 d. The granting body shall provide notice to the recipient

corporation of its intent to recapture the development subsidy and
 state the reasons and amount to be recaptured. The recipient
 corporation shall remit to the governing body that amount not more
 than 60 calendar days after the date of the notice.

5 e. If a recipient corporation fails to create or maintain the required 6 number of jobs inside New Jersey or to pay the required wages and 7 benefits at the project site during all of any three consecutive State 8 fiscal years after the development subsidy is granted, the granting body 9 shall declare the development subsidy null and void, and shall notify 10 the State Treasurer and the recipient corporation of the declaration. 11 The recipient corporation shall, not more than 180 calendar days after 12 the date of the notice of the declaration, repay to the granting body 13 any part of the cost to the granting body of the development subsidy 14 it did not previously repay.

15 f. Any portion of the development subsidy recaptured by a granting body pursuant to this section shall be regarded as a tax liability of the 16 recipient corporation to the granting body. If the recipient corporation 17 fails to pay that tax liability when it becomes due, the recipient 18 19 corporation shall be subject to the penalties and interest provisions of 20 the State Uniform Tax Procedure Law, R.S.54:48-1 et seq. Any 21 recipient corporation which considers any decision or declaration of 22 a granting body to recapture any part of a development subsidy to be 23 inconsistent with the provisions of this act, excessive or otherwise 24 unjust, may appeal to the tax court in accordance with the provisions 25 of the State Uniform Tax Procedure Law, R.S.54:48-1 et seq.

26

27 10. No development subsidy approved at any time following the 28 180th day after the effective date of this act shall have a duration 29 longer than five years, after which the recipient corporation shall not 30 receive any further development subsidy for the project from the granting body until an application is submitted to, and approved, by 31 32 the granting body. Any development subsidy, including any development subsidy provided by means of a tax expenditure, which 33 34 is in effect upon the effective date of this act shall expire as of December 31, 2004, unless the recipient corporation submits to the 35 granting body an application for the renewal of the development 36 37 subsidy consistent with the provisions of section 4 of this act not later 38 than September 30, 2004 and the granting body finds that the 39 application meets the requirements of this act and approves the 40 renewal. Each granting body shall, not later than June 30, 2004, 41 provide, to every recipient corporation receiving a development 42 subsidy from the granting body which will expire as of December 31, 43 2004 pursuant to this section, written notification of that expiration 44 and the procedures to renew the development subsidy. 45

46 11. If a granting body or the State Treasurer fails to enforce any

provision of this act, any individual who paid taxes to the State during the State fiscal year in dispute or the preceding year, or any organization representing any of those taxpayers, shall be entitled to bring a civil action in a court of competent jurisdiction to compel enforcement of this act. The court shall award reasonable attorneys' fees and costs to the prevailing taxpayer or organization.

7

8 12. If a granting body fails to submit any report required by this act 9 to the State Treasurer within the time prescribed by this act, the State 10 Treasurer may, to the extent possible, withhold payments of any State-11 funded development subsidy to the granting body or any recipient 12 corporation which has a project site located in the jurisdiction of the 13 granting body until the public body submits the report with the State 14 Treasurer.

15

16 Any recipient corporation that knowingly makes a false 13. material misrepresentation in any application, report or other 17 disclosure that the recipient corporation is required to make pursuant 18 to this act shall be deemed to have knowingly made a false material 19 20 representation in connection with the negotiation, award or 21 performance of a government contract for the purposes of subsection 22 b. of section 97 of P.L.1999, c.440 (C.2C:21-34) and shall be guilty 23 of a crime as specified in that section.

24

14. Nothing in this act shall be construed as requiring a recipient
corporation to reduce wage or benefit rates of any employee or be
construed as permitting a recipient corporation:

a. To reduce wage or benefit rates established by a collectivebargaining agreement or required by any law or regulation; or

b. To provide, in return for a development subsidy, jobs with lower
wage or benefit rates, a smaller number of jobs, or jobs for a shorter
period of time, than is required with respect to the development
subsidy by any other law or regulation.

34

15. The State Treasurer shall, in consultation with the
Commissioner of Labor, and pursuant to the "Administrative
Procedure Act," P.L.1968, c.410 (C.52:14B-1 et seq.), promulgate
any rules and regulations necessary to implement the provisions of this
act.

40

41 16. This act shall take effect immediately, but the provisions of
42 sections 3 through 14 of this act shall remain inoperative until the
43 180th day after its enactment.

#### STATEMENT

This bill sets requirements regarding certain businesses which receive development subsidies, including tax incentives, from any agency or instrumentality of the State or any of its political subdivisions.

The bill specifies what information a business is required to submit
when applying for a development subsidy. Each recipient of a subsidy
is required to submit annual progress reports for the duration of the
subsidy or five years, whichever is longer.

11 The bill limits the maximum value of development subsidies to \$50,000 per job created and \$15,000 per job retained if all of the jobs 12 13 are in an economically distressed municipality or \$35,000 per job 14 created and \$10,000 per job retained, if they are not. If the recipient 15 of a development subsidy is a small business, those jobs are required to provide average weekly pay and benefits not less than 75% of the 16 17 average pay in the industry of the subsidized project or 50% of the 18 average pay for all workers in the State, whichever is more. If the 19 recipient is not a small business, the jobs are required to provide pay 20 and benefits not less than 85% of the average pay in the industry or 21 60% of the average pay for all workers in the State, whichever is 22 more.

The bill requires the business to meet its employment goals within two years of the beginning date of the subsidy and continue to meet them for at least five years from the beginning date. Otherwise, the business is required to repay part or all of the subsidy to the extent that the employment goals are not met.

28 The State Treasurer is directed to publish an annual Unified 29 Economic Development Budget Report providing comprehensive 30 information about the costs and benefits of all development subsidies of the State and its political subdivisions. The Treasurer is also 31 32 required to provide to the Legislature, as part of the Governor's annual 33 budget request, a comprehensive presentation of the costs of all 34 development subsidies to the State, including the cost of tax 35 incentives.

The bill does not require a subsidy recipient to reduce wages or benefits of employees or permit the recipient to reduce wages or benefits set by collective bargaining, law or regulation, or to provide, in return for a development subsidy, jobs with lower wage or benefit rates, a smaller number of jobs, or jobs for a shorter period of time, than is required with respect to the development subsidy by any other law or regulation.

1 2